



# State of Utah

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY  
DIVISION OF COMPREHENSIVE EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT

Michael O. Leavitt  
Governor  
Craig L. Dearden  
Commissioner  
Ferris E. Groll  
Deputy Commissioner

State Office Building, Room 1110  
P.O. Box 141710  
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114-1710  
(801) 538-3400  
(801) 538-3770 FAX Line

Lorayne Frank  
Director

## UTAH SEISMIC SAFETY COMMISSION

Meeting  
July 2, 1997

### *MINUTES*

On July 2, 1997, a regularly scheduled Utah Seismic Safety Commission quarterly meeting was held at the State Office Building, Room #2112, Salt Lake City, Utah. The meeting was called to order at 9:10 a.m. by Chairman Walter Arabasz.

#### Members Present:

Les Youd	BYU Civil Engineering Department
Lee Allison	Utah Geological Survey
Walter Arabasz	Chair/Seismic Safety Commission--University of Utah Seismograph Stations
James Bailey	Structural Engineers Association of Utah
Lorayne Frank	Division of Comprehensive Emergency Management
James W. Golden	Structural Engineer Division, Department of Transportation
Peter C. Knudson	Utah House of Representatives
Sen. Craig Peterson	Utah State Senate
Barry Smith	Western Mountain Region, American Institute of Architects

#### Members Not Present:

Ken Bullock	Utah League of Cities and Towns
Randall G. Updike	U.S. Geological Survey (Ex-Officio)
Russ Wilder	Federal Emergency management Agency (Ex-Officio)
Suzanne Winters	Governor's Office of Planning and Budget

#### CEM Staff Present:

Bob Carey	Mitigation & Planning Section, CEM
Donald Cobb	Natural & Technological Hazards Bureau, CEM
Maralin Hoff	CSEPP Project, CEM
John Rokich	Mitigation & Planning Section, CEM
Debbie Wilkinson	Emergency Operations Center, CEM

#### UGS Staff Present:

Gary Christenson	Utah Geological Survey
Janine Jarva	Utah Geological Survey
Barry Solomon	Utah Geological Survey

**Other Guests Present:**

Ann Becker	Woodward - Clyde
John Elder	State Fire Marshal's Office
Max A. Gregersen	Centry Constructors & Engineers
Bob Leonard	Davis County School District
Carey Maedgen	Granite School District
Boyd McAllister	Valentiner Crane Architects
Larry Newton	State Office of Education
Carl Patterson	Jordan School District
Gary Payne	Davis County School District
Lee Siegel	Salt Lake Tribune
Bruce A. Spiegel	Division of Risk Management
Bryan Turner	Davis County School District
Arry Welliver	Structural Engineer
Ross Wentworth	NWA
Joni Whitear	State Farm Insurance
Frank Willardson	Granite School District
Gary Wise	State Fire Marshal

**WELCOME / INTRODUCTION**

Chairman Walter Arabasz thanked everyone for attending and asked guests to introduce themselves.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion:** Lorayne Frank made the motion to approve the minutes from the meeting held in April with one correction; on page "3", paragraph five, the following sentence is to be removed from the minutes "*compliance of most school district is uncertain due to no licensed inspectors inspecting the school buildings, however, the school plans are reviewed by the State Structural Engineer.*" The motion was seconded by Lee Allison. The motion was unanimously approved.

**SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION**

The issue of school construction arose incidentally at the Commission's April meeting as part of a presentation by the Engineering and Architecture Subcommittee. The presentation was followed by news reporting and later by correspondence to the Commission by Gary Payne of the Davis County School District. Mr. Payne was invited to speak to the Commission.

□ SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION (Continued)

Under the agenda item, *Do current practices of design, plan-checking, and inspection of new school construction in Utah pose an earthquake-safety issue?*, Walter Arabasz first indicated that the Utah Seismic Safety Commission is not a jury. The Commission's responsibilities according to the state's statute are as follows: *"reviewing earthquake hazards and risks to the state of Utah and its inhabitants, preparing recommendations to identify and mitigate this hazards and risks, acting as a source of information for individuals and groups concerned with earthquake safety, and a promoter of earthquake loss reduction measures."*

Gary Payne, Davis Co. School District/Utah Facilities Operations and Maintenance Assoc.

Gary Payne is President of the Utah Facilities Operations and Maintenance Association, representing several school districts throughout the state. Members meet twice yearly and discuss issues pertinent to school districts. The chief purpose of his presentation to the Commission was to address an earlier report in the Salt Lake Tribune that building inspectors for most Utah School Districts were not licensed to inspect schools. In 1993, a law was passed that all schools be inspected by certified building officials. Gary noted that Larry Newton of the State Office of Education, which has seven or eight licensed inspectors, is in charge of making sure that laws are being followed.

The normal process of designing a new school or an addition to or remodel of an existing school is to hire certified professional architects together with structural, mechanical, and electrical engineers who are proficient in the code. About mid-way through the project, there is a value-engineering (same as peer review) where a "cold" and "hot" team meet to review plans. The hot team and cold team each include architects and engineers. They then divide into specialized groups. Each group goes through each of those plans pertinent to their profession. Structural engineers review calculations and look for unnecessarily costs. Following this process, the State Fire Marshal's Office, which has certified plans examiners, reviews these plans. While the building is being constructed, certified building inspectors are at the job site nearly every day.

Mr. Payne introduced Boyd McAllister of Valenti<sup>er</sup> Crane Architects and Ross Wentworth of NWA, who are involved in extensive school work throughout the state. Gary said that his goal was to design good safe buildings and noted that schools inherently have to durable to withstand heavy-duty wear and tear.

□ SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION (Continued)

Larry Newton, State Office of Education

Larry Newton, State Office of Education, stated that the large school districts are: Washington, Jordan, Davis, Granite, and Salt Lake. Those school districts handle school construction just as Gary indicated. However, the outlying school districts (Alpine, Provo, and Nebo) handle school construction differently. The inspector is under contract to perform inspections. The inspector is a free-lance, International Conference of Building Officials (ICBO) category I, licensed inspector who does the inspection for these three school districts. Another way that business is done in some school districts (e.g., Park City) is by a formal contract whereby municipal inspectors conduct school inspections among their other responsibilities.

Mr. Newton indicated that in 1993 he began the process of trying to inform school district superintendents and architects of the new responsibility to have inspections done by licensed inspectors. A letter was sent to each superintendent with a copy to the architects. The letter requests the name of the ICBO licensed inspector, category I, which is checked with the list provided by the Office of Occupational and Professional Licensing. If the inspector's name is not on that list, the project does not go forward. Periodic reports are requested as the project is in process.

Senator Craig Peterson, Utah State Senate

Senator Craig Peterson indicated that Senate Bill 135 was intended to address concerns relating to individuals who were doing plans examinations who were not qualified to do such reviews. He stated, *"If you are going to do plan examinations of larger buildings, then we ought to have some mechanism in place, to be delegated to the Office of Occupational and Professional Licensing, to develop a standard examination that gives us some confidence that a plans examiner had some experience or training in that field and was capable of doing it. The argument that was thrown back was that small communities could not afford both a building inspector and a plans examiner. There was nothing in the law that said it had to be two different people. The majority of plans examinations are now being done by certified building inspectors. The training was to be provided and paid for by the existing building fees, there would not be any additional fees. An exemption would be if you chose to hire other professionals, such as a hot and cold team [in which case a licensed engineer or architect as a plans examiner would not require additional certification.] It's a choice and not a mandate."*

☐ **SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION (Continued)**

The rule that Carl Eriksson is trying to get passed will provide a trigger if the facility is over a certain size (10,000 square feet). Then it requires a peer review by a licensed structural professional engineer.

Les Youd, Brigham Young University, Civil Engineering Department

Les Youd, BYU Civil Engineering Department, noted that a statement in the minutes from the last meeting needs clarification or correction. On the second page of the minutes it says, *"There may be four or five school districts out of 40 that utilize licensed building inspectors. Compliance of most school districts is uncertain due to no licensed inspectors inspecting the school buildings, however, the school plans are reviewed by the State Structural Engineer."*

After some discussion, Chairman Arabasz asked the Commission, *"Do current practices of design, plan-checking and inspection of new school construction in Utah pose an earthquake-safety issue? Where do we go from here?"* A member of the Seismic Safety Commission responded by saying that after what was heard today, he felt the practices of design, plan-checking and inspection of new school construction DO NOT pose an earthquake safety issue or hazard. Most agree that plan review is an important concept.

Lorayne Frank, Utah Comprehensive Emergency Management, stated that emergency agency agencies have to deal with the after-effects of earthquakes, relying upon the engineering community to ensure that schools and other public buildings are safe for response and recovery needs. She recommended that there be further discussion about school construction and consideration before the Commission makes a decision on the issue of school construction.

Jim Bailey, Structural Engineers Association of Utah, recommended that the Commission address the budget aspect of seismic review of school/hospital and other large construction projects.


**MOTION:** **Walter Arabasz made the motion that the Engineering and Architect Committee make arrangements to invite the concerned guests to further discuss the issue of safe construction of schools in Utah and identify important seismic safety issues relating to other classes of structures. Lorayne Frank seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.**

**PROXY VOTE**


Walter Arabasz asked if the state statute allowed the Utah Seismic Safety Commission accept a vote by a proxy. The Seismic Safety Commission members are appointed by the Governor and confirmation of the State Senate. **There is no provision in the state statute to allow a proxy vote for the Seismic Safety Commission.** Commission members may assign a designee to attend the meeting, but the designee can not vote on issues. The Seismic Safety Commission is consists of 13 members, seven of which need to be attendance at a meeting to have a quorum.

A recommendation was made for the Seismic Commission to allow members to assign alternative non-voting individuals to attend meetings when the member is unable to attend. There was further discussion, but no decision was made on this issue.

**INFORMATION ITEMS**

 The 1997 Annual Conference is scheduled for September 9, 1997, at the State Capitol's Rotunda, Salt Lake City. Registration 7:30 - 8:30 a.m.

**INFORMATION ITEMS (Continued)**

 The WSSPC Awards in Excellence Awards. Six nominations have been received for this award. Deadline to submit nominations is August 15, 1997. The proposed procedure for the awards should be that the Commission reviews and determines who the recipient(s) will be, that/those person(s) selected will than be nominated for the WSSPC Award by the Utah Seismic Commission. The Commission may also nominate others that were not originally nominated.

**NEXT MEETING**

The next quarterly meeting was scheduled as follows:

**DATE:** Friday, October 10, 1997  
**TIME:** 9:00 a.m.  
**PLACE:** Utah State Office Building  
Room #1112

**ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:** A motion to adjourn was made by Lee Allison, Barry Smith seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

\* \* \*